

Online Supplement to ‘Deviance Information Criterion for Model Selection: Justification and Variation’*

Yong Li

Renmin University of China

Jun Yu

Singapore Management University

Tao Zeng

Zhejiang University

November 23, 2017

1 High Order Analytical Expansions

The purpose of this online supplement is to prove Lemma 3.2 in Li, et al (2017). Suppose Θ is a compact subset of R^P . For any $\theta \in \Theta$, $\{h_n(\theta) : n = 1, 2, \dots\}$ is a sequence of eight-times continuously differentiable functions of θ , having an interior global minimum $\{\hat{\theta}_n : n = 1, 2, \dots\}$; $b(\theta)$ is a six-times continuously differentiable real function of θ . For any function $f(\theta)$, let \hat{f} be the value of function f evaluated at $\hat{\theta}_n$, i.e., $\hat{f} := f(\hat{\theta}_n)$. When there is no confusion, we write $h_n(\theta)$ as $h(\theta)$ or h_n or even h and $b(\theta)$ as b . We use $B_\delta(\theta)$ to denote the open ball of radius δ centered at θ . So $B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)$ is an open ball of radius $\sqrt{n}\delta$ centered at the origin. For convenience of exposition, we write $\frac{\partial^d}{\partial\theta_{j_1}\partial\theta_{j_2}\dots\partial\theta_{j_d}}f(\theta)$ as $f_{j_1\dots j_d}$. The Hessian of h_n at θ is denoted by $\nabla^2 h_n(\theta)$, and its (i, j) -component is written as h_{ij} while the components of its inverse is written as h^{ij} . Let $\mu_{ijkq}^4, \mu_{ijkqrs}^6, \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8, \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10}, \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi}^{12}$ be the fourth, sixth, eighth, tenth, and twelfth central moments of a multivariate Normal distribution whose covariance matrix is $(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} := (\nabla^2 h_n(\theta))^{-1}|_{\theta=\hat{\theta}_n}$. Note that we require $h_n(\theta)$ be eight-times continuously differentiable and $b(\theta)$ be six-times continuously differentiable. These two conditions are stronger than what have typically been assumed in the literature on the Laplace approximation as we would like to develop higher order expansions.

Following Kass et al (1990), we call the pair $(\{h_n\}, b)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for Laplace’s method if the following assumptions are met. There exists positive numbers ε, M and η , and an integer n_0 such that $n \geq n_0$ implies (i) for all $\theta \in B_\varepsilon(\hat{\theta}_n)$ and all

*Yong Li, Hanqing Advanced Institute of Economics and Finance, Renmin University of China, Beijing, China 100872. Jun Yu, School of Economics and Lee Kong Chian School of Business, Singapore Management University, 90 Stamford Rd, Singapore 178903. Email for Jun Yu: yujun@smu.edu.sg. URL: <http://www.mysmu.edu/faculty/yujun/>. Tao Zeng, School of Economics and Academy of Financial Research, Zhejiang University, Zhejiang, China 310027. Li gratefully acknowledges the financial support of the Chinese Natural Science Fund (No. 71271221), Program for New Century Excellent Talents in University.

$1 \leq j_1, \dots, j_d \leq P$ with $0 \leq d \leq 8$, $\|h_n(\theta)\| < M$ and $\|h_{j_1 \dots j_d}(\theta)\| < M$; (ii) $\nabla^2 \widehat{h}$ is positive definite and $\det(\nabla^2 \widehat{h}) > \eta$; (iii) $\int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta$ exists and is finite, and for all δ for which $0 < \delta < \varepsilon$ and $B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n) \subseteq \Theta$,

$$\left[\det(n\nabla^2 \widehat{h}) \right]^{\frac{1}{2}} \int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh_n(\theta) - n\widehat{h}] d\theta = O(n^{-3}).$$

If one sets $-nh_n$ to be the sequence of log-likelihood functions of a model (as a sequence of sample size n), we say the model is Laplace regular. Lemma 1.1 below and Lemma 2.1 in the next section extend Theorem 1 and Theorem 5 of Kass et al (1990) to a higher order. They will be used to prove Lemma 3.2 in Li, et al (2017).

Lemma 1.1 *If $(\{h_n\}, b)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for Laplace's method, then*

$$\int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta = (2\pi)^{\frac{P}{2}} \left[\det(n\nabla^2 \widehat{h}) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp[-n\widehat{h}] \left(\widehat{b} + \frac{1}{n} A_1 + \frac{1}{n^2} A_2 + O(n^{-3}) \right),$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} A_1 &= -\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b} + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b} - \frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta}^4 \widehat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{h}^{\zeta\eta}, \\ A_2 &= -\frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b} + \frac{1}{1152} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{rstw} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrstw} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b} - \frac{1}{1728} \sum_{ijkqrstw\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{tw\beta} \mu_{ijkqrstw\beta}^{10} \widehat{b} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{31104} \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi}^{12} \widehat{b} - \frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqr\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijkqr} \mu_{ijkqr\zeta}^6 \widehat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrst\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrst} \mu_{ijkqrst\zeta}^8 \widehat{b}_\zeta - \frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstwv\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstwv\zeta}^{10} \widehat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{48} \sum_{ijkq\zeta\eta} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq\zeta\eta}^6 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta} + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta}^8 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta} \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi} + \frac{1}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4. \end{aligned}$$

Proof. Note that

$$\int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta = \int_{B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta + \int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta,$$

and

$$\int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \left[\det \left(n \nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp \left[-n \widehat{h} \right] \left[\det \left(n \nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right) \right]^{\frac{1}{2}} \int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\widehat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp \left[-n \left(h(\theta) - \widehat{h} \right) \right] d\theta \\
&= \left[\det \left(n \nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp \left[-n \widehat{h} \right] O \left(n^{-3} \right)
\end{aligned}$$

by assumption (iii) above.

Let $u = \sqrt{n} \left(\theta - \widehat{\theta}_n \right)$. Applying the Taylor expansion to $h(\theta)$ at $\widehat{\theta}_n$, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
nh(\theta) &= n\widehat{h} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j + \frac{1}{6} n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k + \frac{1}{24} n^{-1} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{120} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijkqr} \widehat{h}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r + \frac{1}{720} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{5040} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrst} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t + r_n(u),
\end{aligned}$$

where

$$r_n(u) = \frac{1}{40320} n^{-3} \sum_{ijkqrstw} h_{ijkqrstw}(\theta') u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w,$$

and θ' lies between θ and $\widehat{\theta}_n$.

Define

$$\begin{aligned}
x &= \frac{1}{6} n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k + \frac{1}{24} n^{-1} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q + \frac{1}{120} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijkqr} \widehat{h}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{720} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s + \frac{1}{5040} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrst} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t + r_n(u).
\end{aligned}$$

Applying the Taylor expansion to $\exp(-x)$ at the origin, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\exp(-nh) &= \exp \left\{ -n \widehat{h} \right\} \exp \left(-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right) \times \\
&\quad \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 + R_{1,n} \left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n \right) \right),
\end{aligned}$$

where,

$$\begin{aligned}
\Xi_1 &= -\frac{1}{6} n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k - \frac{1}{24} n^{-1} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q - \frac{1}{120} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijkqr} \widehat{h}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{720} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s - \frac{1}{5040} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrst} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\Xi_2 = \frac{1}{36} n^{-1} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s + \frac{1}{242} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{rstw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \frac{1}{72} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrst} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t + \frac{1}{360} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrstw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w \\
& + \frac{1}{1440} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrstvw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v \\
& + \frac{1}{2160} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrstvw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\Xi_3 & = -\frac{1}{216} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw} h_{ijk} h_{qrs} h_{twv} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v \\
& - \frac{1}{288} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta} h_{ijk} h_{qrs} h_{twv\beta} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta \\
& - \frac{1}{1152} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau} h_{ijk} h_{qrst} h_{wv\beta\tau} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau \\
& - \frac{1}{1440} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau} h_{ijk} h_{qrs} h_{twv\beta\tau} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\Xi_4 & = \frac{1}{1296} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau u_\phi \\
& + \frac{1}{1296} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi\alpha} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi\alpha} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau u_\phi u_\alpha,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\Xi_5 = -\frac{1}{7776} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi\alpha\chi\varrho} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{\alpha\chi\varrho} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau u_\phi u_\alpha u_\chi u_\varrho.$$

Taylor-expanding $b(\theta)$ at $\widehat{\theta}_n$, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
b(\theta) & = \widehat{b} + n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum_i \widehat{b}_i u_i + \frac{1}{2} n^{-1} \sum_{ij} \widehat{b}_{ij} u_i u_j + \frac{1}{6} n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum_{ijk} \widehat{b}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k \\
& + \frac{1}{24} n^{-2} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{b}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q + \frac{1}{120} n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqr} \widehat{b}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r + R_{2,n}(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n).
\end{aligned}$$

Hence,

$$\begin{aligned}
b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] & = \left\{ \exp[-n\widehat{h}] \right\} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] \left\{ I_n(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n) + R_n(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n) \right\} \\
& = \left(\sqrt{2\pi} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\widehat{h}) \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] \\
& \quad \times \left\{ I_n(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n) + R_n(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n) \right\},
\end{aligned}$$

where $I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ and $R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ will be specified below. Thus,

$$\begin{aligned}
& \int_{B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta \\
&= (\sqrt{2\pi})^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \times \\
& \quad \int_{B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n)} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \{I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)\} d\theta \\
&= (\sqrt{2\pi})^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) (\sqrt{n})^{-\frac{P}{2}} \times \\
& \quad \int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \{I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)\} du \\
&= (\sqrt{2\pi})^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \times \\
& \quad \int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left\{ \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \right\} \{I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)\} du,
\end{aligned}$$

where $R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ is the sum of terms involving $R_{1,n}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$, $R_{2,n}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ and terms of order equal to or smaller than $O(n^{-3})$. Furthermore, we can get

$$R_{2,n}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = \frac{1}{720} n^{-3} \sum b_{ijkqs}(\tilde{\theta}) u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s,$$

where $\tilde{\theta}$ lies between θ and $\hat{\theta}_n$. So the leading term of $R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ are $\hat{b}R_{1n}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + R_{2n}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n)$ which include $r_n(u)$. The integral of $r_n(u)$ over $B_\varepsilon(\hat{\theta}_n)$ can be expressed as

$$\begin{aligned}
& \left| n^{-3} \int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \sum_{ijkqrstw} h_{ijkqrstw}(\theta') u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w du \right| \\
& \leq n^{-3} \int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \sum_{ijkqrstw} |h_{ijkqrstw}(\theta')| |u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w| du \\
& \leq n^{-3} M \int_{R^P} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \sum_{ijkqrstw} |u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w| du \\
& = O(n^{-3}),
\end{aligned}$$

where $\int_{R^P} \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j\right] \sum_{ijkqrstw} |u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w| du$ is the eighth order moment of folded multivariate folded normal distribution with mean 0 and covariance $(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1}$ which is finite; see Kamat (1953) and Kan and Robotti (2017). Then we have

$$(\sqrt{2\pi})^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} [I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) + R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta})] f(u) du$$

$$= \left(\sqrt{2\pi}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} \left|n\nabla^2\widehat{h}\right|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp\left(-n\widehat{h}\right) \left[\int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} I_n\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}\right) f(u) du + O\left(n^{-3}\right)\right].$$

For $I_n\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right)$ we have

$$I_n\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) = I_n^0\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) + I_n^1\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) + I_n^2\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) + I_n^3\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) + I_n^4\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) + I_n^5\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right),$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^0\left(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n\right) &= \widehat{b}\left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2}\Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6}\Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24}\Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120}\Xi_5\right) \\ &= \widehat{b}\left\{1 + n^{-\frac{1}{2}}I_n^{01} + n^{-1}I_n^{02} + n^{-\frac{3}{2}}I_n^{03} + n^{-2}I_n^{04} + n^{-\frac{5}{2}}I_n^{05}\right\}, \end{aligned}$$

$$I_n^{01} = -\frac{1}{6}\sum_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{ijk}u_iu_ju_k, \quad I_n^{02} = -\frac{1}{24}\sum_{ijkq}\widehat{h}_{ijkq}u_iu_ju_ku_q + \frac{1}{72}\sum_{ijkqrs}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_s,$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^{03} &= -\frac{1}{120}\sum_{ijkqr}\widehat{h}_{ijkqr}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_r + \frac{1}{144}\sum_{ijkqrst}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrst}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_t \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{1296}\sum_{ijkqrstvw}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}\widehat{h}_{tuvw}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_v, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^{04} &= -\frac{1}{720}\sum_{ijkqrs}\widehat{h}_{ijkqrs}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_s + \frac{1}{1152}\sum_{ijkqrst}\widehat{h}_{ijkq}\widehat{h}_{rstw}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_w \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{720}\sum_{ijkqrstw}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrstw}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_w \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{1728}\sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}\widehat{h}_{tuvw\beta}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_vu_\beta \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{31104}\sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}\widehat{h}_{tuvw}\widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_vu_\beta u_\tau u_\phi, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^{05} &= -\frac{1}{5040}\sum_{ijkqrst}\widehat{h}_{ijkqrst}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_t + \frac{1}{2880}\sum_{ijkqrstvw}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrstvw}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_v \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{5120}n^{-\frac{5}{2}}\sum_{ijkqrstvw}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrstvw}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_v \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{6912}\sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrst}\widehat{h}_{vw\beta\tau}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_vu_\beta u_\tau \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{8640}\sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}\widehat{h}_{tuvw\beta\alpha}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_vu_\beta u_\tau \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{31104}\sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi\alpha}\widehat{h}_{ijk}\widehat{h}_{qrs}\widehat{h}_{tuvw}\widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi\alpha}u_iu_ju_ku_qu_ru_su_tu_wu_vu_\beta u_\tau u_\phi u_\alpha \end{aligned}$$

$$-\frac{1}{933120} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi\alpha\chi\varrho} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \hat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} \hat{h}_{\alpha\chi\varrho} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau u_\phi u_\alpha u_\chi u_\varrho,$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^1(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum \hat{b}_\zeta u_\zeta \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 \right) \\ &= n^{-\frac{1}{2}} \sum \hat{b}_\zeta u_\zeta + n^{-1} I_n^{11}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + n^{-\frac{3}{2}} I_n^{12}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + n^{-2} I_n^{13}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) \\ &\quad + n^{-\frac{5}{2}} I_n^{14}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n), \end{aligned}$$

$$I_n^{11}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta,$$

$$I_n^{12}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta,$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^{13}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= -\frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqr} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrst} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstvw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^{14}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= -\frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijkqrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{1152} \sum_{ijkqrstw\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{rstw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrstw\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrstw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{1728} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv\beta} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{31104} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta\tau\phi\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \hat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\beta u_\tau u_\phi u_\zeta \hat{b}_\zeta, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^2(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= n^{-1} \frac{1}{2} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta} u_\zeta u_\eta \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \left[n^{-1} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta} u_\zeta u_\eta + n^{-\frac{3}{2}} I_n^{21}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + n^{-2} I_n^{22}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + n^{-\frac{5}{2}} I_n^{23}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$I_n^{21}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta},$$

$$I_n^{22}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta} + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta},$$

$$I_n^{23}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqr\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta} + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrst\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrst} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta}$$

$$-\frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{tuvw} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_t u_w u_v u_\zeta u_\eta \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta},$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^3(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \frac{1}{6} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi} u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{6} \left[n^{-\frac{3}{2}} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi} u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi + n^{-2} I_n^{31}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) + n^{-\frac{5}{2}} I_n^{32}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$I_n^{31}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi},$$

$$I_n^{32}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi} + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r u_s u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi},$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^4(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= n^{-2} \frac{1}{24} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi u_\omega \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{24} \left[n^{-2} \sum \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi u_\omega + n^{-\frac{5}{2}} I_n^{41}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$I_n^{41}(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) = -\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta} \hat{h}_{ijk} u_i u_j u_k u_\zeta u_\eta u_\xi u_\omega \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega},$$

$$\begin{aligned} I_n^5(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) &= n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqr} \hat{b}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r \left(1 + \Xi_1 + \frac{1}{2} \Xi_2 + \frac{1}{6} \Xi_3 + \frac{1}{24} \Xi_4 + \frac{1}{120} \Xi_5 \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{120} \left[n^{-\frac{5}{2}} \sum_{ijkqr} \hat{b}_{ijkqr} u_i u_j u_k u_q u_r \right]. \end{aligned}$$

Let

$$f(u) = \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} \left| \nabla^2 \hat{h} \right|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left\{ \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] \right\},$$

be the density function of the Normal distribution with mean 0 and covariance matrix $(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1}$. Then we have

$$\begin{aligned} &\int_{R^p} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}_n) f(u) du \\ &= \hat{b} + \frac{1}{n} \left(-\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq}^4 + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 - \frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijk\zeta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta}^4 \hat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{h}^{\zeta\eta} \right) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \frac{1}{n^2} \left(\begin{aligned}
& -\frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 + \frac{1}{1152} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{rstw} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \\
& + \frac{1}{720} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrstw} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 - \frac{1}{1728} \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv\beta} \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10} \\
& + \frac{1}{31104} \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi} \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi}^{12} \\
& - \frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqr\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijkqr} \mu_{ijkqr\zeta}^6 \widehat{b}_\zeta + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrst\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrst} \mu_{ijkqrst\zeta}^8 \widehat{b}_\zeta \\
& - \frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstwv\zeta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstwv\zeta}^{10} \widehat{b}_\zeta \\
& - \frac{1}{48} \sum_{ijkq\zeta\eta} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq\zeta\eta}^6 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta} + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs\zeta\eta}^8 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta} \\
& - \frac{1}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi} + \frac{1}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{b}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4
\end{aligned} \right) \\
& + O(n^{-3}).
\end{aligned}$$

Note that the odd order central moments of the multivariate normal distribution vanish and, by expanding the domain from $B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)$ to R^P , the error can be expressed as

$$\begin{aligned}
& \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} u_i u_j u_k u_q f(u) du \\
& = \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} u_i u_j u_k u_q f(u) du \\
& = \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} u_i u_j u_k u_q \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] du \\
& = \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} u_i u_j u_k u_q \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] du \\
& \leq \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} u_i u_j u_k u_q \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \sum_{ij} \lambda_{\min} u_i u_j \right] \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \sum_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ij} u_i u_j \right] du \\
& \leq \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \lambda_{\min} \delta^2 n \right] \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P} u_i u_j u_k u_q \exp \left[-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \left(\frac{1}{2} \widehat{h}_{ij} \right) u_i u_j \right] du \\
& = M' \exp \left[-\frac{1}{4} \lambda_{\min} \delta^2 n \right],
\end{aligned}$$

where $\lambda_{\min} > 0$ is the smallest eigenvalue of $\nabla^2 \widehat{h}$ and

$$M' = \left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \right)^{\frac{p}{2}} |\nabla^2 \widehat{h}|^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \int_{R^P} u_i u_j u_k u_q \exp \left[-\sum_{ij} \left(\frac{1}{4} \widehat{h}_{ij} \right) u_i u_j \right] du < \infty,$$

by the imposed assumptions. The first inequality follows from the fact that

$$\lambda_{\min} = \min_{\|e\|=1} f(e) = e^T A e,$$

where A is a positive definite matrix, and λ_{\min} is the the smallest eigenvalue of A . Here, we only express one term of $I_n(\theta, \widehat{\theta}_n)$. The other terms can be analyzed similarly.

Hence, we have

$$\int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du = \int_{R^P} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du - \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta \\ = & \int_{B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta + \int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta \\ = & \left(\sqrt{2\pi}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \left[\int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} \left[I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) + R_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) \right] f(u) du + O(n^{-3}) \right] \\ = & \left(\sqrt{2\pi}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \left[\int_{B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du + O(n^{-3}) \right] \\ = & \left(\sqrt{2\pi}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \left[\begin{array}{c} \int_{R^P} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du \\ - \int_{R^P - B_{\sqrt{n}\delta}(0)} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du \end{array} + O(n^{-3}) \right] \\ = & \left(\sqrt{2\pi}\right)^{\frac{P}{2}} |n\nabla^2 \hat{h}|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp(-n\hat{h}) \left[\int_{R^P} I_n(\theta, \hat{\theta}) f(u) du + O(n^{-3}) \right]. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, this lemma is proved. ■

2 High Order Stochastic Expansions

In this section we will develop high order stochastic Laplace expansions. Suppose $\mathbf{y} = (y_1, y_2, \dots, y_n)'$ is a collection of random variables defined on a common probability space $\{\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \wp_\theta\}$, where Ω is a sample space, \mathcal{F} is a sigma-algebra, and \wp_θ is a probability measure that depends on parameter $\theta \in \Theta$, a compact subset of R^P . Assume $\{y_i, i = 1, 2, \dots\}$ take values in the same mathematical space \mathfrak{S} , which must be measurable with respect to some sigma-algebra, Σ . Let $h_n(\mathbf{y}, \theta)$ be a sequence of functions, each of which is eight-times continuously differentiable with respect to θ and has an interior global minimum $\{\hat{\theta}_n : n = 1, 2, \dots\}$; $b(\theta)$ is a six-times continuously differentiable real function of θ . When there is no confusion, we write $h_n(\mathbf{y}, \theta)$ as $h(\theta)$ or h_n or even h and $b(\theta)$ as b . For any function $f(\theta)$, let \hat{f} be the value of function f evaluated at $\hat{\theta}_n$, i.e., $\hat{f} := f(\hat{\theta}_n)$.

We call the pair $(\{h_n\}, b)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for the stochastic Laplace method on \wp_θ if the following assumptions are satisfied. There exists positive numbers ε , M and η such that (i) with probability approach one (w.p.a.1), for all $\theta \in B_\varepsilon(\hat{\theta}_n)$ and all $1 \leq j_1, \dots, j_d \leq P$ with $0 \leq d \leq 8$, $\|h_n(\theta)\| < M$ and $\|h_{j_1 \dots j_d}(\theta)\| < M$; (ii) w.p.a.1, $\nabla^2 \hat{h}$ is positive definite and $\det(\nabla^2 \hat{h}) > \eta$; (iii) $\int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp(-nh_n(\theta)) d\theta$ exists and is finite, and

for all δ for which $0 < \delta < \varepsilon$ and $B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n) \subseteq \Theta$,

$$\left[\det \left(n \nabla^2 \hat{h} \right) \right]^{\frac{1}{2}} \int_{\Theta - B_\delta(\hat{\theta}_n)} b(\theta) \exp \left[-n \left(h_n(\theta) - \hat{h} \right) \right] d\theta = O_p \left(n^{-3} \right).$$

Note that our assumptions are different from those in Section 3 of Kass et al (1990) in two aspects. First, we require $h_n(\theta)$ be eight-times continuously differentiable and $b(\theta)$ be six-times continuously differentiable. Second, for conditions (ii) and (iii), instead of almost sure boundedness and almost sure convergence, we assume they hold w.p.a.1. We do so because we are interested in convergence in probability only. Following the result in Theorem 7 of Kass et al (1990), $(\{h_n\}, b)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for stochastic Laplace's method on \wp_θ and Lemma 1.1 above, it is straightforward to show that

$$\int_{\Theta} b(\theta) \exp[-nh(\theta)] d\theta = (2\pi)^{\frac{p}{2}} \left[\det \left(n \nabla^2 \hat{h} \right) \right]^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp[-n\hat{h}] \left(\hat{b} + \frac{1}{n} A_1 + \frac{1}{n^2} A_2 + O_p(n^{-3}) \right), \quad (1)$$

where the expressions for A_1 and A_2 are given in Lemma 1.1.

Lemma 2.1 *If both $(\{h_n\}, g \times b_D)$ and $(\{h_n\}, b_D)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for the stochastic Laplace method on \wp_θ , then*

$$\frac{\int g(\theta) b_D(\theta) \exp(-nh_n(\theta)) d\theta}{\int b_D(\theta) \exp(-nh_n(\theta)) d\theta} = \hat{g} + \frac{1}{n} B_1 + \frac{1}{n^2} (B_2 - B_3) + O_p \left(\frac{1}{n^3} \right),$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} B_1 &= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} + \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{g}_i}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \hat{g}_q, \\ B_2 &= -\frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkqrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{g}_s + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrst} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{g}_w \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstvw\beta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstvw\beta}^{10} \hat{g}_\beta - \frac{1}{24} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{b}_{D,s} \hat{g}_r}{\hat{b}_D} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{72} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{b}_{D,w} \hat{g}_t}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi} \hat{g}_\zeta}{\hat{b}_D} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega} \hat{g}_\zeta}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{48} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{g}_{rs} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{g}_{tw} - \frac{1}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} - \frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi}}{\hat{b}_D} \end{aligned}$$

$$+ \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{b}_{D,\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} + \frac{1}{4} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{b}_{D,\xi\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D},$$

$$B_3 = \left(\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,ij}}{\widehat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,q}}{\widehat{b}_D} + \frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 - \frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \right) B_1,$$

where $\sigma_{ij} = h^{ij}$.

Proof. If $\{h^N(\theta), b_N\}$ and $\{h^D(\theta), b_D\}$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for the stochastic Laplace method on φ_θ , then by (1)

$$\frac{\int b_N(\theta) \exp[-nh^N(\theta)] d\theta}{\int b_D(\theta) \exp[-nh^D(\theta)] d\theta} = \frac{|\nabla^2 \widehat{h}^N|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp[-nh(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)] b_k(\widehat{\theta}_n^N) + \frac{1}{n} c_N + \frac{1}{n^2} d_N + O_p(n^{-3})}{|\nabla^2 \widehat{h}^D|^{-\frac{1}{2}} \exp[-nh(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)] b_k(\widehat{\theta}_n^D) + \frac{1}{n} c_D + \frac{1}{n^2} d_D + O_p(n^{-3})}.$$

From Tierney and Kadane (1986) and Miyata (2004, 2010), we have

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N) + \frac{1}{n} c_N + \frac{1}{n^2} d_N + O_p(n^{-3})}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D) + \frac{1}{n} c_D + \frac{1}{n^2} d_D + O_p(n^{-3})} = \frac{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} \left[\frac{1 + \frac{1}{n} \frac{c_N}{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)} + \frac{1}{n^2} \frac{d_N}{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)} + O_p(n^{-3})}{1 + \frac{1}{n} \frac{c_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} + \frac{1}{n^2} \frac{d_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} + O_p(n^{-3})} \right] \\ & = \frac{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} \left\{ \begin{aligned} & 1 + \frac{1}{n} \left(\frac{c_N}{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)} - \frac{c_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} \right) \\ & + \frac{1}{n^2} \left(\frac{d_N}{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)} - \frac{d_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} - \frac{c_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} \left(\frac{c_N}{b_N(\widehat{\theta}_n^N)} - \frac{c_D}{b_D(\widehat{\theta}_n^D)} \right) \right) + O_p(n^{-3}) \end{aligned} \right\}, \end{aligned}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \left(\frac{c_N}{\widehat{b}_N} - \frac{c_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right) &= \frac{\widehat{b}_N (c_N \widehat{b}_D - c_D \widehat{b}_N)}{\widehat{b}_D^2 \widehat{b}_N} = \frac{c_N \widehat{b}_D - c_D \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{\sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{N,ij} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{D,ij} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_{N,q} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_{D,q} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{72} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrs}^N \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 - \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{24} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^N \mu_{ijkq}^4 - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^D \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D}, \end{aligned}$$

where $\sigma_{ij} = h^{ij}$.

$$\frac{\widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \left(\frac{d_N}{\widehat{b}_N} - \frac{d_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -\frac{1}{720} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs}^N \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 - \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkqrs}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{1152} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^N \widehat{h}_{rstw}^N \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 - \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^D \widehat{h}_{rstw}^D \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{720} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrstw}^N \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 - \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrstw}^D \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&- \frac{1}{1728} \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrs}^N \widehat{h}_{twv}^N \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10} - \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \widehat{h}_{twv}^D \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{31104} \frac{\left(\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrs}^N \widehat{h}_{twv}^N \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi}^N \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi}^{12} - \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \widehat{h}_{twv}^D \widehat{h}_{\beta\tau\phi}^D \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta\tau\phi}^{12} \widehat{b}_N \right)}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&- \frac{1}{120} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^N \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_{N,s} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_{D,s} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{144} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrst}^N \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_{N,w} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrst}^D \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_{D,w} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{1296} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrs}^N \widehat{h}_{twv}^N \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10} \widehat{b}_{N,\beta} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkqrstwv\beta} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \widehat{h}_{twv}^D \mu_{ijkqrstwv\beta}^{10} \widehat{b}_{D,\beta} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{48} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^N \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_{N,rs} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_{D,rs} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{144} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrst}^N \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_{N,tw} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrst}^D \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{b}_{D,tw} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{36} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{24} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{c_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \frac{\widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \left(\frac{c_N}{\widehat{b}_N} - \frac{c_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right) &= \frac{1}{2} c_D \frac{\sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{N,ij} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{D,ij} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^3} \\
&- \frac{1}{6} c_D \frac{\sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \mu_{ijkq} \widehat{b}_{N,q} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_{D,q} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^3} \\
&+ \frac{1}{72} c_D \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \widehat{h}_{qrs}^N \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \widehat{h}_{qrs}^D \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{24} c_D \frac{\widehat{b}_N \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^N \mu_{ijkq}^4 - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq}^D \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2}.
\end{aligned}$$

If we set $b_N(\theta) = g(\theta) b_D(\theta)$ and $h^N(\theta) = h^D(\theta) = h(\theta)$, we can show the following results

for the derivatives of $b_N(\theta)$:

$$b_{N,i}(\theta) = g_i(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta), \quad (2)$$

$$b_{N,ij}(\theta) = g_{ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta), \quad (3)$$

$$\begin{aligned} b_{N,ijk}(\theta) &= g_{ijk}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_{ij}(\theta) b_{D,k}(\theta) + g_{ik}(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,jk}(\theta) + g_{jk}(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) \\ &\quad + g_j(\theta) b_{D,ik}(\theta) + g_k(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,ijk}(\theta), \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

$$\begin{aligned} b_{N,ijkq}(\theta) &= g_{ijkq}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_{ijk}(\theta) b_{D,q}(\theta) + g_{ijq}(\theta) b_{D,k}(\theta) + g_{ij}(\theta) b_{D,kq}(\theta) \\ &\quad + g_{ikq}(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_{ik}(\theta) b_{D,jq}(\theta) + g_{iq}(\theta) b_{D,jk}(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,jkq}(\theta) \\ &\quad + g_{jkq}(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) + g_{jk}(\theta) b_{D,iq}(\theta) + g_{jq}(\theta) b_{D,ik}(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,ikq}(\theta) \\ &\quad + g_{kq}(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta) + g_k(\theta) b_{D,ijq}(\theta) + g_q(\theta) b_{D,ijk}(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,ijkq}(\theta), \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

$$\begin{aligned} &b_{N,ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,ij}(\theta) b_N(\theta) \\ &= [g_{ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta)] b_D(\theta) - b_{D,ij}(\theta) g(\theta) b_D(\theta) \\ &= g_{ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta)^2 + g_i(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) b_D(\theta) \\ &\quad + g(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,ij}(\theta) g(\theta) b_D(\theta) \\ &= g_{ij}(\theta) b_D(\theta)^2 + g_i(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) b_D(\theta), \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

$$\begin{aligned} &b_{N,i}(\theta) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,i}(\theta) b_N(\theta) \\ &= (g_i(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta)) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,i}(\theta) g(\theta) b_D(\theta) = g_i(\theta) b_D(\theta)^2, \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

$$\begin{aligned} &b_{N,ijk}(\theta) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,ijk}(\theta) b_N(\theta) \\ &= \left[\begin{aligned} &g_{ijk}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_{ij}(\theta) b_{D,k}(\theta) + g_{ik}(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,jk}(\theta) \\ &+ g_{jk}(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,ik}(\theta) + g_k(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta) \end{aligned} \right] b_D(\theta), \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

$$\begin{aligned} &b_{N,ijkq}(\theta) b_D(\theta) - b_{D,ijkq}(\theta) b_N(\theta) \\ &= \left[\begin{aligned} &g_{ijkq}(\theta) b_D(\theta) + g_{ijk}(\theta) b_{D,q}(\theta) + g_{ijq}(\theta) b_{D,k}(\theta) + g_{ij}(\theta) b_{D,kq}(\theta) \\ &+ g_{ikq}(\theta) b_{D,j}(\theta) + g_{ik}(\theta) b_{D,jq}(\theta) + g_{iq}(\theta) b_{D,jk}(\theta) + g_i(\theta) b_{D,jkq}(\theta) \end{aligned} \right] b_D(\theta) \\ &\quad + \left[\begin{aligned} &g_{jkq}(\theta) b_{D,i}(\theta) + g_{jk}(\theta) b_{D,iq}(\theta) + g_{jq}(\theta) b_{D,ik}(\theta) + g_j(\theta) b_{D,ikq}(\theta) \\ &+ g_{kq}(\theta) b_{D,ij}(\theta) + g_k(\theta) b_{D,ijq}(\theta) + g_q(\theta) b_{D,ijk}(\theta) \end{aligned} \right] b_D(\theta). \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

Thus, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D} \left(\frac{c_N}{\widehat{b}_N} - \frac{c_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right) &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{\sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{N,ij} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{b}_{D,ij} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^N \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_{N,q} \widehat{b}_D - \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk}^D \mu_{ijkq}^4 \widehat{b}_{D,q} \widehat{b}_N}{\widehat{b}_D^2} \end{aligned}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} (\hat{b}_{N,ij} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,ij} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} - \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 (\hat{b}_{N,q} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,q} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2},$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} (\hat{b}_{N,ij} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,ij} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} &= \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} (\hat{g}_{ij} \hat{b}_D^2 + \hat{g}_i \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{b}_D + \hat{g}_j \hat{b}_{D,i} \hat{b}_D)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} \hat{b}_D^2 + 2 \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_i \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\ &= \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} + \frac{2 \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{g}_i}{\hat{b}_D}, \end{aligned}$$

from (6) and

$$\frac{\hat{b}_{N,q} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,q} \hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D^2} = \frac{(\hat{g}_q \hat{b}_D + \hat{g} \hat{b}_{D,q}) \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,q} \hat{g} \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D^2} = \hat{g}_q$$

by (7). Hence,

$$\frac{\hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D} \left(\frac{c_N}{\hat{b}_N} - \frac{c_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} + \frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{g}_i}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \hat{g}_q.$$

From (8) and (9), we can get

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk}^N \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_D - \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk}^D \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \left[\hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_D + \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi} + \hat{g}_{\zeta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\eta} + \hat{g}_{\zeta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi} + \hat{g}_{\eta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\zeta} + \hat{g}_\eta \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\xi} + \hat{g}_\xi \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta} \right]}{\hat{b}_D} \\ &= \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} + \frac{3 \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi}}{\hat{b}_D} + \frac{3 \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi}}{\hat{b}_D}, \quad (10) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \hat{b}_D - \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\ &= \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} + \frac{4 \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\omega}}{\hat{b}_D} + \frac{6 \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi\omega}}{\hat{b}_D} \\ & \quad + \frac{4 \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega}}{\hat{b}_D} + \frac{4 \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega}}{\hat{b}_D}. \quad (11) \end{aligned}$$

We can also show that

$$\frac{\hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D} \left(\frac{d_N}{\hat{b}_N} - \frac{d_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \frac{1}{120} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 (\hat{b}_{N,s} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,s} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{144} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrst} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 (\hat{b}_{N,w} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,w} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{1296} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstuvw\beta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstuvw\beta}^{10} (\hat{b}_{N,\beta} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,\beta} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{48} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 (\hat{b}_{N,rs} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,rs} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{144} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 (\hat{b}_{N,tw} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,tw} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&- \frac{1}{36} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 (\hat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2} \\
&+ \frac{1}{24} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 (\hat{b}_{N,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \hat{b}_D - \hat{b}_{D,\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \hat{b}_N)}{\hat{b}_D^2}.
\end{aligned}$$

since $h^N(\theta) = h^D(\theta) = h(\theta)$. Hence, with (6), (7), (10), and (11), it can be shown that

$$\begin{aligned}
&\frac{\hat{b}_N}{\hat{b}_D} \left(\frac{d_N}{\hat{b}_N} - \frac{d_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right) \\
&= -\frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{g}_s + \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrst} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{g}_w \\
&- \frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstuvw\beta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstuvw\beta}^{10} \hat{g}_\beta - \frac{1}{24} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{b}_{D,s} \hat{g}_r}{\hat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{72} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{b}_{D,w} \hat{g}_t}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_\zeta \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi}}{\hat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_\zeta \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega}}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{48} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{g}_{rs} \\
&+ \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{g}_{tw} - \frac{1}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \\
&+ \frac{1}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} - \frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi}}{\hat{b}_D} \\
&+ \frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{b}_{D,\omega}}{\hat{b}_D} + \frac{1}{4} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \hat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \hat{b}_{D,\xi\omega}}{\hat{b}_D}.
\end{aligned}$$

■

Using matrix notation for high order derivatives used in Magnus and Neudecker (1999) (with the exception that the first order derivative of a scalar function in our setting is a column

vector), we can write Lemma 2.1 in matrix form. Before we do that, let us first introduce the following Generalized Isserlis theorem.

Theorem 2.1 (Generalized Isserlis Theorem) *If $A = \{\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_{2N}\}$ is a set of integers such that $1 \leq \alpha_i \leq P$, for each $i \in [1, 2N]$ and $X \in R^P$ is a zero mean multivariate normal random vector, then*

$$E(X_A) = \sum_A \Pi E(X_i X_j), \quad (12)$$

where $E X_A = E(\prod_{i=1}^{2N} X_{\alpha_i}) = \mu_{\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_{2N}}$ and the notation $\sum \Pi$ means summing over all distinct ways of partitioning $X_{\alpha_1}, \dots, X_{\alpha_{2N}}$ into pairs (X_i, X_j) and each summand is the product of the N pairs. This yields $(2N)! / (2^N N!) = (2N - 1)!!$ terms in the sum where $(2N - 1)!!$ is the double factorial defined by $(2N - 1)!! = (2N - 1) \times (2N - 3) \times \dots \times 1$.

The Isserlis theorem, first obtained by Isserlis (1918), expresses the higher order moments of a zero mean Gaussian vector $X \in R^P$ in terms of its covariance matrix. The generalized Isserlis theorem is due to Withers (1985) and Vignat (2012). For example, if $2N = 4$, then

$$E(X_1 X_2 X_3 X_4) = E(X_1 X_2) E(X_3 X_4) + E(X_1 X_3) E(X_2 X_4) + E(X_1 X_4) E(X_2 X_3)$$

where $\alpha_i = i$ for $i \in [1, 4]$ and there are $(2 \times 2 - 1)!! = 3 \times 1 = 3$ terms in the sum. If $2N = 6$, there are $5 \times 3 \times 1 = 15$ terms in the sum.

Lemma 2.2 *Let $\nabla^j \hat{h}$, $\nabla^j \hat{g}$ and $\nabla^j \hat{b}_D$ be the j th order derivatives of $h(\theta)$, $g(\theta)$ and $b_D(\theta)$ evaluated at $\hat{\theta}_n$ respectively. If both $(\{h_n\}, g \times b_D)$ and $(\{h_n\}, b_D)$ satisfy the analytical assumptions for the stochastic Laplace method on \wp_θ , then*

$$\frac{\int g(\theta) b_D(\theta) \exp(-nh_n(\theta)) d\theta}{\int b_D(\theta) \exp(-nh_n(\theta)) d\theta} = \hat{g} + \frac{1}{n} B_1 + \frac{1}{n^2} (B_2 - B_3) + O_p\left(\frac{1}{n^3}\right),$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} B_1 &= \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \nabla^2 \hat{g} \right] + (\nabla \hat{g})' \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{2} \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \nabla^3 \hat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \nabla \hat{g}, \\ B_2 &= -\frac{1}{8} (\nabla \hat{g})' \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^5 \hat{h} \right)' \mathit{vec} \left[\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \otimes \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \\ &\quad + \frac{35}{48} (\nabla \hat{g})' \left[\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \otimes \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right]' \nabla^4 \hat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^3 \hat{h} \right)' \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \\ &\quad - \frac{35}{48} \nabla \hat{g}' \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^3 \hat{h} \right)' \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \times \\ &\quad \left[\mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^3 \hat{h} \right)' \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \\ &\quad - \frac{5}{8} (\nabla \hat{g})' \left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \mathit{tr} \left[\left[\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \otimes \mathit{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \hat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \left(\nabla^4 \hat{h} \right)' \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \frac{35}{24} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] \\
& - \frac{5}{4} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \text{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right] \\
& + \frac{1}{2} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{(\nabla^3 \hat{b}_D)'}{\hat{b}_D} \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] \\
& - \frac{5}{16} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] (\nabla^4 \hat{h})' \right] \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \hat{g} \right] \\
& + \frac{35}{48} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \text{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \hat{g} \right] \\
& - \frac{5}{12} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{g})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \\
& + \frac{1}{8} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] \nabla^4 \hat{g}' \right] \\
& - \frac{5}{4} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \hat{g} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \\
& + \frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{g} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} + \frac{3}{4} \mathbf{tr} \left[\nabla^2 \hat{g} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right] \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right],
\end{aligned}$$

$$B_3 = B_4 \times B_1,$$

$$\begin{aligned}
B_4 & = \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \right] - \frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \hat{h}^{(3)} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \\
& + \frac{5}{24} \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^3 \hat{h}' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] \\
& - \frac{1}{8} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] (\nabla^4 \hat{h})' \right],
\end{aligned}$$

where $\sigma_{ij} = h^{ij}$ and \mathbf{tr} denotes the trace of a matrix.

Proof. From (2.1), we first write each term of B_1 into matrix form by (12)

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} & = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{g}_{ij} = \frac{1}{2} \text{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \hat{g} \right], \\
\frac{\sum_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{b}_{D,j} \hat{g}_i}{\hat{b}_D} & = \sum_{ij} \hat{g}_i \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \frac{\hat{b}_{D,j}}{\hat{b}_D} = (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} - \frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \nabla^3 \hat{h} \nabla \hat{g}, \\
-\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \hat{g}_q & = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{g}_q = -\frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla \hat{g}.
\end{aligned}$$

Then we can similarly write each term of B_2 into matrix form by (12)

$$-\frac{1}{120} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{g}_s = -\frac{15}{120} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{h}_{ijkqr} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{g}_s$$

$$= -\frac{1}{8} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right],$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{g}_w \\ = & \frac{105}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{g}_w \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{\sigma}_{tw} = \frac{35}{48} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{g}_w (\hat{\sigma}_{wt} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{h}_{trsq}) \hat{\sigma}_{qk} (\hat{h}_{kij} \hat{\sigma}_{ij}) \\ = & \frac{35}{48} (\nabla \hat{g})' \left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right]' \nabla^4 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right), \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & -\frac{1}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstuvw\beta} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{h}_{twv} \mu_{ijkqrstuvw\beta}^{10} \hat{g}_\beta \\ = & -\frac{945}{1296} \sum_{ijkqrstuvw\beta} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{\sigma}_{tw} \hat{h}_{twv} \hat{\sigma}_{v\beta} \hat{g}_\beta \\ = & -\frac{35}{48} \sum_{twv\beta} \hat{g}_\beta \hat{\sigma}_{\beta v} (\hat{\sigma}_{tw} \hat{h}_{twv}) \sum_{ijkqrs} (\hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{h}_{ijk}) \hat{\sigma}_{kq} (\hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{\sigma}_{rs}) \\ = & -\frac{35}{48} \nabla \hat{g}' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \times \\ & \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \hat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & -\frac{1}{24} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{g}_r \hat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \hat{b}_{D,s} \hat{g}_r}{\hat{b}_D} \\ = & -\frac{15}{24} \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{g}_r \hat{h}_{ijkq} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \frac{\hat{b}_{D,s}}{\hat{b}_D} = -\frac{5}{8} \sum_{rs} \hat{g}_r \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \frac{\hat{b}_{D,s}}{\hat{b}_D} \sum_{ijkq} \hat{h}_{ijkq} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \\ = & -\frac{5}{8} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \text{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] (\nabla^4 \hat{h})' \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{1}{72} \frac{\sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \hat{b}_{D,w} \hat{g}_t}{\hat{b}_D} \\ = & \frac{105}{72} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \hat{g}_t \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{h}_{qrs} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{\sigma}_{tw} \frac{\hat{b}_{D,w}}{\hat{b}_D} = \frac{35}{24} \sum_{tw} \left(\hat{g}_t \hat{\sigma}_{wt} \frac{\hat{b}_{D,w}}{\hat{b}_D} \right) \sum_{ijkqrs} \hat{h}_{ijk} \hat{\sigma}_{ij} \hat{\sigma}_{kq} \hat{\sigma}_{rs} \hat{h}_{qrs} \\ = & \frac{35}{24} (\nabla \hat{g})' (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \hat{b}_D}{\hat{b}_D} \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \hat{h} (\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \nabla^3 \hat{h}' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \hat{h})^{-1} \right) \right], \end{aligned}$$

$$-\frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \hat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \hat{b}_{D,\eta\xi} \hat{g}_\zeta}{\hat{b}_D}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= -\frac{15}{12} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{g}_\zeta \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{k\zeta} \widehat{\sigma}_{\eta\xi} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\eta\xi}}{\widehat{b}_D} = -\frac{5}{4} \sum_{ijk\zeta} \widehat{g}_\zeta \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta k} \left(\widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \right) \sum_{\eta\xi} \widehat{\sigma}_{\eta\xi} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\eta\xi}}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&= -\frac{5}{4} (\nabla \widehat{g})' (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \widehat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right) \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right], \\
\frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{g}_\zeta}{\widehat{b}_D} &= \frac{3}{6} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{g}_\zeta \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{\sigma}_{\xi\omega} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{g}_\zeta \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta\eta} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\eta\xi\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} \widehat{\sigma}_{\xi\omega} \\
&= \frac{1}{2} (\nabla \widehat{g})' (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \frac{(\nabla^3 \widehat{b}_D)'}{\widehat{b}_D} \left[\text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right) \right], \\
-\frac{1}{48} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \widehat{g}_{rs} &= -\frac{15}{48} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \sum_{rs} \widehat{\sigma}_{rs} \widehat{g}_{rs} \\
&= -\frac{5}{16} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] (\nabla^4 \widehat{h})' \right] \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \widehat{g} \right], \\
\frac{1}{144} \sum_{ijkqrstw} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrstw}^8 \widehat{g}_{tw} \\
&= \frac{105}{144} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{rs} \sum_{tw} \widehat{\sigma}_{tw} \widehat{g}_{tw} = \frac{35}{48} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{rs} \sum_{tw} \widehat{\sigma}_{tw} \widehat{g}_{tw} \\
&= \frac{35}{48} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \widehat{h})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right) \mathbf{tr} \left[(\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \widehat{g} \right], \\
-\frac{1}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \\
&= -\frac{15}{36} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{k\zeta} \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{\sigma}_{\eta\xi} = -\frac{5}{12} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} (\nabla^3 \widehat{g})' \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right), \\
\frac{1}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} &= \frac{3}{24} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{\sigma}_{\xi\omega} \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \\
&= \frac{1}{8} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[(\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right) \right] (\nabla^4 \widehat{g})' \right], \\
-\frac{1}{12} \frac{\sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi}^6 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{b}_{D,\xi}}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&= -\frac{15}{12} \sum_{ijk\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{k\zeta} \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{\sigma}_{\eta\xi} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\xi}}{\widehat{b}_D} = -\frac{5}{4} \text{vec} \left((\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \nabla^2 \widehat{g} (\nabla^2 \widehat{h})^{-1} \frac{\nabla \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D},
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{6} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{b}_{D,\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} &= \frac{3}{6} \sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta\xi} \widehat{\sigma}_{\xi\omega} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{g} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D}, \\
\frac{1}{4} \frac{\sum_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega} \mu_{\zeta\eta\xi\omega}^4 \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{b}_{D,\xi\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} &= \frac{3}{4} \sum_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{g}_{\zeta\eta} \widehat{\sigma}_{\zeta\eta} \sum_{\xi\omega} \widehat{\sigma}_{\xi\omega} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,\xi\omega}}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&= \frac{3}{4} \mathbf{tr} \left[\nabla^2 \widehat{g} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right] \mathbf{tr} \left[\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right].
\end{aligned}$$

And we have

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,ij}}{\widehat{b}_D} = \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right], \quad (13)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
-\frac{1}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \mu_{ijkq}^4 \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,q}}{\widehat{b}_D} &= -\frac{3}{6} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \frac{\widehat{b}_{D,q}}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&= -\frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D},
\end{aligned} \quad (14)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&\frac{1}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \mu_{ijkqrs}^6 \\
&= \frac{15}{72} \sum_{ijkqrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{h}_{ijk} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \widehat{h}_{qrs} \widehat{\sigma}_{rs} \\
&= \frac{5}{24} \left[\text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^3 \widehat{h} \right)' \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right]
\end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

$$\begin{aligned}
-\frac{1}{24} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \mu_{ijkq}^4 &= -\frac{3}{24} \sum_{ijkq} \widehat{h}_{ijkq} \widehat{\sigma}_{ij} \widehat{\sigma}_{kq} \\
&= -\frac{1}{8} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \left(\nabla^4 \widehat{h} \right)' \right].
\end{aligned} \quad (16)$$

From (13), (14), (15) and (16), we define

$$\begin{aligned}
B_4 &= \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla^2 \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \right] - \frac{1}{2} \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \frac{\nabla \widehat{b}_D}{\widehat{b}_D} \\
&\quad + \frac{5}{24} \left[\text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right)' \nabla^3 \widehat{h} \left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \left(\nabla^3 \widehat{h} \right)' \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{8} \mathbf{tr} \left[\left[\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \otimes \text{vec} \left(\left(\nabla^2 \widehat{h} \right)^{-1} \right) \right] \left(\nabla^4 \widehat{h} \right)' \right].
\end{aligned}$$

■

Proof of Lemma 3.2 in Li et al (2017) can be obtained by directly applying Lemma 2.2 above by setting $b_D(\theta) = p(\theta)$, $g(\theta) = l_t(\theta)$, $-nh^N(\theta) = -nh^D(\theta) = \ln p(\mathbf{y}|\theta)$.

References

- 1 Chen, C. (1985). On asymptotic normality of limiting density functions with Bayesian implications. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society Series B*, **47**, 540–546.
- 2 Kamat, A. R. (1953). Incomplete and Absolute Moments of the Multivariate Normal Distribution with Some Applications, *Biometrika*, **40**, 20–34.
- 3 Kan, R. and C. Robotti (2017). On Moments of Folded and Truncated Multivariate Normal Distributions, *Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics*, forthcoming.
- 4 Kass, R., Tierney, L., and J. B. Kadane (1990). The validity of posterior expansions based on Laplace’s Method. in *Bayesian and Likelihood Methods in Statistics and Econometrics*, ed. by S. Geisser, J.S. Hodges, S.J. Press and A. Zellner. Elsevier Science Publishers B.V.: North-Holland.
- 5 Li, Y., Yu, J., and T. Zeng (2017). Deviance Information Criterion for Bayesian Model Selection: Justification and Variation, Singapore Management University.
- 6 Miyata, Y. (2004). Fully exponential Laplace approximations using asymptotic modes. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, **99**, 1037–1049.
- 7 Miyata, Y. (2010). Laplace approximations to means and variances with asymptotic modes. *Journal of Statistical Planning and Inference*, **140**, 382–392.
- 8 Tierney, L. and J. B. Kadane (1986). Accurate approximations for posterior moments and marginal densities. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, **81**, 82–86.
- 9 Vignat, C. (2012). A generalized Isserlis theorem for location mixtures of Gaussian random vectors. *Statistics & Probability Letters*, **82(1)**, 67-71.
- 10 Withers C.S. (1985) The moments of the multivariate normal, *Bulletin of the Australian Mathematical Society*, **32**, 103-107